



MEMO ENDORSED

MICHAEL A. CARDOZO
Corporation Counsel

THE CITY OF NEW YORK
LAW DEPARTMENT
100 CHURCH STREET
NEW YORK, NY 10007

JAMES MIRRO
Special Assistant Corporation Counsel
phone (212) 788-8026 fax (212) 788-9776

January 23, 2006

BY FAX

The Honorable James C. Francis IV
United States Magistrate Judge
Daniel Patrick Moynihan
United States Courthouse
500 Pearl Street - Room 1960
New York, New York 10007-1312

USDC SDNY DOCUMENT ELECTRONICALLY FILED DOC #: DATE FILED: <u>1/24/06</u>

DOCKET
IN ALL
CASES
↓

Re: Crotty, et al. v. The City of New York, et al. (USDC SDNY 05 CV 7577 (KMK) (JCF))
Coburn, et al. v. The City of New York, et al. (USDC SDNY 05 CV 7623 (KMK) (JCF))
Sloan, et al. v. The City of New York, et al. (USDC SDNY 05 CV 7668 (KMK) (JCF))
Galitzer, et al. v. The City of New York, et al. (USDC SDNY 05 CV 7669 (KMK) (JCF))
Abdell, et al. v. The City of New York, et al. (USDC SDNY 05 CV 8453 (KMK) (JCF))
Adams, et al. v. The City of New York, et al. (USDC SDNY 05 CV 9484 (KMK) (JCF))
Will, et al. v. The City of New York, et al. (USDC SDNY 05 CV 9974 (KMK) (JCF))
Emmer v. The City of New York, et al. (USDC SDNY 05 CV 9993 (KMK) (JCF))
Bruce v. The City of New York, et al. (USDC SDNY 05 CV 10006 (KMK) (JCF))
Scharf v. The City of New York, et al. (USDC SDNY 05 CV 10012 (KMK) (JCF))

Dear Judge Francis:

As we discussed with you at the last RNC status conference, on January 18, 2006, defendants respectfully request that you order plaintiffs in the above-captioned cases to release to defendants their information that has been sealed pursuant to New York Criminal Procedure Law § 160.50. As Your Honor is aware, to obtain information sealed pursuant to NYCPL § 160.50, including the Criminal Court files and District Attorney's files that relate to the arrest and prosecution of these plaintiffs, and to begin to investigate the circumstances of those arrests and prosecutions, defendants need properly executed releases from plaintiffs.

In a series of letters to plaintiffs in the foregoing actions, Defendants have provided to plaintiffs blank release forms and have requested their prompt cooperation in executing them. Defendants subsequently have written to plaintiffs in each of these actions on multiple occasions to remind them of the information needed, to apprise them that these cases cannot proceed without their cooperation and to inform them that Defendants would be forced to seek court intervention in the absence of their cooperation in discovery.

By way of example, attached please find the September 29, 2005 letter (and 3 follow-up letters) in the case of Coburn, et al. v. The City of New York, et al. (Exh. "A"). Substantially identical letters have been sent in each of these cases on the following dates:

Crotty - November 10, December 28
Coburn - September 29, October 31, December 1 and December 29
Sloan - September 28, November 2, and December 29
Galitzer - September 29, November 4, December 8 and December 29
Abdell - October 17, December 6, December 28
Adams - November 21, December 6 and December 28
Will - December 28, January 10
Emmer - December 8, December 29
Bruce - December 9, December 29
Scharf - December 19, January 6

Despite these repeated requests, the following plaintiffs have failed to provide releases:

Crotty - Kavita Kulkarni
Coburn - Sarah Coburn
Sloan - Emily Sloan; Michael Sladek
Galitzer - Gwynn Galitzer
Abdell - Laura Kressley
Adams - Sidney Vault; Scott Beibin
Will - Bradley Will
Emmer - Keith Emmer
Bruce - Douglas Bruce
Scharf - Andrea Scharf

Given the critical importance of the discovery sought through these releases, the ample opportunity provided to plaintiffs to cooperate in discovery, the repeated warnings to plaintiffs that defendants would seek Court intervention absent compliance and the complete failure of these plaintiffs to comply with defendants' requests, defendants respectfully request that plaintiffs in the above-captioned actions be ordered to provide to defendants properly executed releases within ~~five (5)~~ *ten (10)* days of your order on this application or be subject to the dismissal of their claims. *ten (10)*

Very truly yours,

James Mirro
 James Mirro

cc: Counsel in the captioned cases (by email)
 Peter Farrell
 Fred Weiler
 Jed Weiss
 Jeff Dougherty

1/24/06
Application granted as modified.

SO ORDERED.

James C. Francis IV
USMS